



## Services Quality Evaluation of the Senior High School Hindu Religious Education during Covid-19 Pandemic: Students' vs Teachers' Perspectives

I Gede Suwindia<sup>1</sup>, Ni Nyoman Kurnia Wati<sup>2</sup>, I Ketut Sudarsana<sup>3</sup>

<sup>12</sup>Sekolah Tinggi Agama Hindu Negeri Mpu Kuturan Singaraja, Bali, Indonesia

<sup>3</sup>Universitas Hindu Negeri I Gusti Bagus Sugriwa Denpasar, Bali, Indonesia

<sup>1</sup>igedesuwindia76@gmail.com

### Abstract

Character education has become the core of the Indonesian education curriculum. Thus, the role of religious education is undeniable. However, the Covid-19 pandemic brought a lot of trouble for religious teachers to provide quality education services. This study aimed to evaluate religious education service quality and identify the teachers' constraints in providing education services amid the Covid-19 pandemic. Four state senior high schools in Singaraja were taken as the setting of the study. The researchers distributed questionnaires to 100 senior high school students in each school to collect data on the service quality, but only 380 students answered the questionnaires thoroughly. To collect the data about the data on the constraints in providing the religious education service, the researchers interviewed 12 teachers, three religious education teachers in each school. The results of the questionnaires were quantified and analyzed quantitatively. While the results of the interviews were analyzed qualitatively. Specifically, the researchers analyzed the data using descriptive statistics and T-score to analyze the questionnaire results and an interactive data analysis model to analyze the results of the interviews. Furthermore, to determine the level of service quality of the senior high school religious education, the researchers categorized the T-score based on the Glickman quadrant theory. This study found that the service quality was categorized as very good from the context and input variables, and the process and product variables were categorized as good. Based on those data, the service quality of the senior high school religious education was generally categorized as very good. Though the service quality was very good, the interviews' results showed that the teachers faced some constraints in providing educational services to the students. Detailed findings and recommendations are provided in this article. In conclusion, the students felt they had already received quality religious education services from the teachers. The teachers tried to do their best despite facing many constraints in delivering religious education.

**Keywords:** Evaluation of Service Quality, Religious Education, High School

### Introduction

Education is a basic need of every individual in living his life (Chalkiadaki, 2018; Zhu et al., 2021). The government requires education for at least nine years, which is recommended more than that. Education is a conscious and planned effort to create a learning atmosphere and learning process so that students actively develop their potential to have religious-spiritual strength, self-control, personality, intelligence, noble character, and skills needed by themselves, society, nation, and state (Law of the Republic of Indonesia Number 20 of 2003 Concerning the National Education System, 2003). The role of education is vast in realizing a complete and independent human being and becoming a noble and beneficial human being for the environment (Anam et al., 2019).

Accordingly, the Ethiopian Education and Training Policy assumes that education is an instrument for development (Gedifew, 2020). Good education will prepare and help the students to get a better future (Bellés-Obrero & Duchini, 2021). Furthermore, education may also influence the economic growth of a country (Castelló-Climent & Hidalgo-Cabrillana, 2012; Dumciuviene, 2015). Some studies also have proven that education can cultivate students' characters (Davidson et al., 2011; Rokhman et al., 2014). In addition, in Indonesian education

system, the purpose of Education is to realize students who have religious-spiritual strength. This is, of course, supported by good curriculum content (Puchalski et al., 2021; Rykkje et al., 2021). One of the contents in the curriculum to realize educational goals is through religious education. Religious education provides knowledge and shapes students' attitudes, personalities, and skills in practising their religious teachings (Government Regulation of the Republic of Indonesia Number 55 of 2007 Concerning Religious Education and Religious Education, 2007). Religious education functions to form Indonesian people who believe and fear God Almighty have a noble character and can maintain peace and harmony in internal and inter-religious relations.

The importance of religious education in the personality development of students demands a good quality of religious education services in schools. Service quality is the expected level of excellence and control over the level of excellence to meet customer desires (Tjiptono, 2020). Service quality will determine the satisfaction of service users. Service quality is realized through meeting customer needs and desires and delivery accuracy in balancing or exceeding customer expectations (Tjiptono & Chandra, 2012). Service quality indicators are generally divided into 10 (ten), namely: (1) tangible, physical appearance of the equipment, personnel, and communication materials; (2) reliability, the ability to carry out the promised service responsibly and accurately; (3) responsiveness, the desire to help users and provide prompt service; (4) competency, mastery of skills and knowledge needed to carry out services; (5) courtesy, respect and friendliness of liaison personnel; (6) credibility, trustworthy and generous from service providers; (7) security, free from the dangers of risk and doubt; (8) access, ease of contact and dedication; (9) communication, keeping users informed in easy-to-understand language, and always willing to listen to user complaints; and (10) understanding the customer, always trying to understand users and their needs (Permendikbud No 32 of 2018 Concerning Technical Standards for Minimum Education Services, 2018).

Religious Education Services by schools are included in the school administration and management system (Gunawan & Wahyuni, 2018; Hayadin, 2018). Technical Standards for Minimum Education Services Article 7 contains eight academic unit standards: graduate competency, content, process, facilities, infrastructure, management, financing, and assessment. In addition, the quality of education services can also be seen from the number and quality of educators and education personnel, geographical location and school environment, as well as school management and collaboration (Mukhamedov et al., 2000; Shaturaev, 2021).

Singaraja is one of the regencies in Bali. Every school in the Singaraja district certainly provides religious education services to students. Religious education services provided to students aim to produce quality students who have a solid foundation of faith values and are knowledgeable in cognitive, affective, and psychomotor (Abdullah, 2020; Sopandi & Siswanto, 2021). Religious education services in schools have several problems, especially during the pandemic, attitude assessment is rather difficult to do, the number of teaching staff for religious teachers in each school is not proportional to the number of students, learning materials are rote, teachers are still not able to make learning media, especially online learning so that practically makes it difficult for teachers to teach (Asrifan, 2020; Onyema, 2020).

Regarding the quality of education services, especially religious education, until now, there has been no evaluation carried out by independent parties or related parties, so the quality of religious education services is not known, especially in high schools throughout Singaraja, Bali. It is hoped that the quality of religious education services can continue improving. There is also a need for a study of the results or outcomes of religious education services, especially in high schools throughout Singaraja, Bali, as well as a study of the obstacles faced by educational units in providing services so that they can be used as a reference in making policies (Sunu, 2011).

The evaluation carried out in this study is an evaluation related to the components of the context, input, process, and product. Evaluation of the CIPP model program (context-input-

process-product) is an evaluation model developed by Stufflebeam and colleagues at Ohio State University. The four components of the evaluation are a complete series. The advantage of evaluating the CIPP program is that it provides a comprehensive evaluation format at each evaluation stage, namely the context, input, process, and product stages (Stufflebeam, 2000).

Based on the description above, his study aims to determine the quality of religious education service and identify the teachers' constraints in providing education services amid the Covid-19 pandemic.

## Method

This study can be classified as a concurrent mixed method study that aims to evaluate the service quality of religious education and to identify the problems faced by the teachers in providing religious education services in senior high schools. This study was conducted in four state high schools in Singaraja, Bali. The study subjects were the students and religious teachers at those schools. To get the data from the students, the researchers distributed a questionnaire developed using the CIPP evaluation theory by Stufflebeam (2003), which consisting of four variables: context, input, process, and product. Before the questionnaire was used to collect the data, it was tested to ensure that it was valid and reliable. A total of 400 questionnaires were distributed. However, only 380 questionnaires were returned. The collected data were then analyzed quantitatively using descriptive statistics and T-score. Then, the t-score was categorized based on the Glickman quadrant.

On the other hand, to collect the data from the teachers to identify constraints faced by the teachers, the researchers conducted interviews. The researchers selected three religious teachers from four state high schools in Singaraja that became the setting of the study. Thus, there was 12 religious education involved in this study. Then, the interview results were analyzed qualitatively using an interactive data analysis model that consisted of three steps, data reduction, data display, and conclusion drawing/verification (Miles et al., 2014).

## Results and Discussion

### 1. The Religious Education Service Quality from Students' Perspective

Based on the descriptive data analysis that has been carried out, an overview of the characteristics of the distribution of scores from each variable is obtained. The results of the descriptive data analysis in this study are as follows.

Table 1. Recapitulation of Descriptive Statistics of Each Variable

ANALYSIS	CONTEXT	INPUT	PROCESS	PRODUCT
Average	33,66	42,63	50,67	23,15
Median	35	45	53	24
Modus	38	45	54	24
Std. Deviation	4,73	6,05	6,35	3,67
Variants	22,34	36,62	40,30	13,50
Span	18	23	36	17
Minimum Score	21	26	30	12
Maximum Score	39	49	66	29

Based on table 01 above, the context variables obtained mean = 33.66, median = 35, mode = 38, standard deviation = 4.73, variance = 22.34, range = 18, minimum score = 21, and score maximum = 39. The average context variable is 33.66, which is in the **Very Effective** category. The input variables got mean = 42.63, median = 45, mode = 45, standard deviation = 6.05, variance = 36.62, range = 23, minimum score = 26, and maximum score = 49. The average

input variable is 42.63, which is in the Very Effective category.

Based on table 01 above, the process variable gets an average = 50.67, median = 53, mode = 54, standard deviation = 6.35, variance = 40.30, range = 36, minimum score = 30, and score maximum = 66. The average process variable is 50.67, which is in the **Effective** category. The product variables in the table get mean = 23.15, median = 24, mode = 24, standard deviation = 3.67, variance = 13.50, range = 17, minimum score = 12, and maximum score = 29. Average The average product variable is 23.15, so it is in the **Effective** category.

To determine the effectiveness of the quality of religious education services in senior high schools throughout Singaraja, Bali, a quantitative descriptive analysis of univariate/theoretical ideal criteria was carried out and used analysis using T-score analysis. Descriptive analysis with T-score was conducted on four variables: context, input, process, and product. After each is analyzed with a T-score, the direction of its effectiveness is determined. The results of data analysis for the scores of context, input, process, and product variables with a T-score can be seen in Table 2.

Table 2. The Effectiveness of the Quality of Religious Education Services

Variable	Variable	T-score Direction			Description
		F+	F-	Result	
Religious Services	Context	271	109	+	++++ (positive, positive, positive, positive)
	Input	248	132	+	
	Process	239	141	+	
	Product	215	165	+	

Based on Table 2 above, it can be explained that the effectiveness of the quality of religious education services in senior high schools throughout Singaraja, Bali is positive-positive - positive - positive (+ + + +). If these results are converted into the Glickman quadrant (Sunu, 2010), it can be concluded that the effectiveness of quality of religious education services in senior high schools throughout Singaraja, Bali, is classified as very effective.

#### a. Context

Based on descriptive data analysis on the effectiveness of religious education services in senior high schools throughout Singaraja, Bali, in terms of context variables, it is in the very effective category. When viewed from each indicator, the context variable consists of 4 indicators, each having two statements. After analyzing the scores of each indicator item, the results show that: 1) The indicators of geographical conditions are in the good category with an average of 88.71, 2) The indicators of community participation support are in the sufficient category with an average of 80.89, 3) The average government policy variable is 79.76 with sufficient category, and 4) the school policy indicator is on average 87.29 with good category.

The geographical condition of the school strongly supports the implementation of religious education services. The strategic location of the school and being close to students strongly support students' religious activities. Community participation, especially among parents, is quite good. However, a commitment to developing religious education services is needed, especially in preparing students to participate in school and higher levels religious competitions. Government policies in implementing the 2013 curriculum are also quite good. Religious education in the 2013 curriculum is combined with character, and the hours of lessons for religious subjects are added. School policies are also considered very well by students. This can be seen from the policies taken by the school and its commitment to providing good religious education services.

The local government of Bali issued Pergub No. 79 of 2018 concerning the Day of Use of Balinese Traditional Clothing which is also one of the government's support for implementing religious education services, especially Hinduism. One of the articles states that traditional Balinese clothing is used during working hours every Thursday, Full Moon, Tilem, and Provincial Anniversary on August 14. The rules for using traditional Balinese clothing aim to preserve and preserve Balinese

Traditional Clothing to strengthen identity, character, and character. The government hopes that students are trained to love their culture and have character as one of the values seen in religious humans. In addition to directing and providing guidance to teachers to see the development of education, especially religious education in schools, the government also assists in the form of *gong baleganjur*, a traditional Balinese music instrument, so that students can learn to accompany religious ceremonies carried out in schools. The support from the ministry of religion is also substantial, both in the form of support through BOS funding support and buildings.

Indicators still low in terms of context are government policies and support for community participation. In terms of government policies that refer to PP 55 of 2007 concerning Religious and Religious Education, as well as PMA 16 of 2010 concerning the Management of Religious Education in Schools, it is necessary to have stronger legal support and umbrella in terms of handling Religious and Religious Education to be more effective at schools in the future. The school situation in which there are teachers and students, if not under a strong umbrella, will impact the psychological situation of teachers in teaching so that the context of community support will be lacking. Regarding managing religious education in schools, quality is the main goal of adhering to the eight mandated standards.

### **b. Input**

Based on descriptive data analysis on the effectiveness of religious education services in senior high schools throughout Singaraja, Bali, in terms of input variables, it is in the very effective category. When viewed from each indicator, the input variable consists of 5 indicators, namely: 1) indicators of the school vision, school mission, school resources, students, and service funding. Judging from the school's vision, the average is 93, 13 in the very good category, 2) the average school mission indicator is 88.21 in the good category, 3) the school resource indicator is on average 83, 55 in the good category, 4) student indicators the category is good with an average of 83.50, and 5) the service funding indicator has an average of 78.95 the category is sufficient.

The school's vision and mission strongly support religious education services. An example of the vision of SMA N 1 Singaraja is "Excellent in Quality, Character, Global Insight". From this mission, missions about the character were made, including 1) developing a positive culture/culture, 2) instilling polite behaviour based on noble character as a source of wisdom in acting, 3) optimizing discipline to improve discipline for all school members, and 4) optimizing respect for the banner of nationality and statehood. These visions and missions show that deepening character values is indispensable for advancing education.

### **c. Process**

Based on descriptive data analysis on the effectiveness of religious education services in senior high schools throughout Singaraja, Bali, in terms of process variables, they are in the effective category. This indicates that the implementation of religious education in high schools throughout Singaraja, Bali, has been going well. The indicators in the process variable consist of 1) service policy making, 2) service management, 3) service curriculum implementation, 4) utilization of service infrastructure, 5) cooperation and participation, 6) accountability process, and 7) financial management.

The results of the analysis of the scores for each indicator item show that: 1) policy-making service indicators, on average 82.87 are in the fairly good category, 2) service management indicators are on average 80.84 are in a good category, 3) implementation indicators the average service curriculum is 51.26 in the very poor category, 4) the average service infrastructure utilization indicator is 80.34 in the sufficient category, 5) the average cooperation and participation indicator is 50.89 in the very poor category, 6) the average accountability process indicator is 79.13 in the sufficient category, and 7) the financial management indicator in the average category is 81.34 in the sufficient category.

The results of the analysis of the scores for each item of the process variables above are strengthened by the results of interviews that have been conducted with the religious education service policy supervisor in schools and the religious education service policy supervisor from the Singaraja

district ministry of religion, Drs I Made Sarjana. The results of the interviews show that: in general, the activities of the religious education service process in high schools throughout Singaraja have been going quite well. However, there are several obstacles faced in the implementation of the process of religious education services in schools. The obstacle lies in the service curriculum's implementation, cooperation, and participation.

The applicable curriculum is generally quite good, but some materials are only rote, so students cannot practise directly. Because they are currently still in the Covid-19 pandemic, the obstacle faced by teachers is the difficulty of providing optimal religious education services to students. Especially if there is a problem with an internet connection network that is less stable so that the process of religious education services does not run smoothly, teachers find it difficult to supervise the students' learning process at home, so teachers cannot know for sure whether students are studying well/not at home. Another obstacle is assessing student attitudes due to the online learning process. This makes teachers try even harder to provide objective assessments to students.

#### **d. Product**

Product variables are in the effective category based on descriptive data analysis on the effectiveness of the quality of religious education services in senior high schools throughout Singaraja, Bali. The results of the analysis of the scores for each indicator item show that: 1) the average religious education service quality indicator is 76.50 in the sufficient category, 2) the student's religious skill indicator is an average of 76.42 in the sufficient category, and 3) the indicator of student satisfaction with religious education services is an average of 84.24 in the good category.

## **2. Constraints in Providing the Religious Education Service from Teachers' Perspectives**

Obstacles in providing religious education services in schools during a pandemic, the most challenging thing for teachers to do is assess student attitudes. The religious practice also cannot run well because distance learning is constrained. For more practice, teachers emphasize parents in supervising, and from the school, they maintain good communication with parents. Another obstacle, according to one religion teacher, another obstacle through online learning is the network/network, so sometimes the assignments are not well received by students. Likewise, with the time for collecting assignments, many students are not on time collecting assignments, and some even do not make assignments given by the teacher. The solution is that teachers will continue to communicate with parents and maximize the performance of Counseling Guidance (BK) teachers so that problems can be appropriately resolved.

In addition, the religious subject matter in the 2013 curriculum is considered quite heavy, as in elementary school. For example, lessons such as *Slokas* have been taught in elementary schools so that basic abilities such as *Tri Sandhya* and attitude cultivation are neglected because students mostly memorize. This, of course, has an impact on the next level. With the weight of the material provided, students tend not to feel the meaning of the lessons delivered. Studying religion is simply memorizing to get good grades. The government has responded to the solution to the problem. It is proven that there are supporting books to guide students' practice so that the expectations of religious learning that prioritize changing attitudes for the better can be realized (Sudarsana, et al, 2023).

The form of religious education services in high school that schools in the future expect is to multiply the types of modules related to examples of the application of daily activities from religious lessons so that religious lessons are not only limited to theory. Examples that already exist in the current module can be reproduced even more. The procurement of this module is also expected to be able to support continuous communication between schools and parents. The parents of the students can also understand the teacher's expectations of the assignments' results. In addition, religious teachers need counselling/guidance and socialization regarding basic matters that can be guided in teaching religion in schools.

Another hope for religious education services is that the younger generation of Hindus needs to open their mindset to understanding religious education. There must be something that is guided in

the act so that it does not just rely on "old people used to say that". Understanding of Hinduism needs to be fostered from a young age so that it will give birth to a young generation who is moderate and responsible for themselves, their families, other people, and their country.

The form of religious education services in the future is also expected to have breakthroughs or ways to open the minds of the younger generation of Hindus so that their minds are more open and consider that religious education is important, both from its implementation. Religious lessons are not just academic lessons but lessons that shape students' character attitudes (the nature of religion) which will later serve as guidelines for students.

Specifically, the teachers' constraints based on CIIP evaluation aspects can be explained as follows:

**a. Context**

The results of the interview show that there is a need for legal guarantees for teachers in educating students to be more disciplined. Teachers are sometimes afraid to scold students, let alone make physical contact. Considering the case of teachers who went to prison for hitting or scolding their students. Likewise, with the support of community participation, according to him, there needs to be an agreement between parents and the school to educate children so that schools are not at least blamed if something happens to students. This shared perception is also important so that when one of the religious education services involves the school committee, the parents quickly respond to the activities or support the school expects. Community support and government policies in religious education services can increase if this can run well.

**b. Input**

According to the teachers, children who are not polite and even lazy to attend prayers are undoubtedly present in every class. Some students left class for a long time during class, came late during *Purnama* (full moon) holy day, so they didn't join the prayer together, joked when doing the praying, and played with mobile phones when the teacher explained the lesson. Religious education services receive adequate funding, but not all religious education service programs in schools can be funded optimally. Furthermore, the teachers also admitted that religious activities are not allowed to take a budget from the school's operational funds. Thus, to make those religious activities can be carried out in schools, schools make voluntary donations from teachers and students. The teachers hope there will be a more flexible policy or regulation in using funds for religious activities in schools.

Based on the results of the interview, it was found that teachers always try to provide religious education services well. The facilities owned by the school are very supportive of Hindu religious education services such as the school temple for prayer. In the classroom, there is a place for students to pray in class. Hindu religious education services in schools also have adequate places.

**c. Process**

The obstacle in providing religious education services to students is the teacher's minimal ability to apply technology, information, and communication, especially to make interesting learning media used during online learning. Therefore, it is hoped that there will be training that can improve the ability of teachers to utilize technology, information, and communication. The next obstacle is the indicators of cooperation and community participation. It has been going well when viewed from the side of cooperation and community participation. However, cooperation and community participation in developing religious education services in schools are minimal, especially in providing facilities and infrastructure for religious education services to students. This is because schools do not dare to collect donations in any form to the community, so in developing religious education services in schools, schools only rely on financial assistance from the government.

**d. Product**

Based on the teachers' information, some students have participated in several religious competitions, such as *dharmagita* or *mekidung*, a type of Balinese Hindu religious song. This activity was done to develop and channel students' hobbies in singing. A real example of implementing religious education, especially Hinduism, is arranging the greeting "*Om Swastyastu*" and doing *Tri*

*Sandhya* or praying according to the time. In addition, holding prayers either on certain days or on big days are attended by all school members. Other forms of service, such as yoga or yoga practice once a week, and if there are competitions such as *Dharmagita* and others, the school will implement it as a program from the ministry or the province.

The form of evaluation in religious lessons is written, such as exams and practice (in carrying out yoga). From there, students are forced to change their character and can overcome problems in themselves, so they can be independent, intelligent, and wise. Another form of implementing religious learning is by giving reflections or dharma discourses to provide understanding to students every dead moon/*tilem* and religious holy days. The form of evaluation in the curriculum or academically, namely in the form of learning such as daily tests and non-academic in the form of teacher monitoring through student behaviour (student personality) which was observed during learning and outside the classroom.

The interviews showed that students were satisfied with religious education services because, from the beginning, students did not understand the rules of religion to understand the meaning and meaning of religious life through the learning process. Test scores can prove student satisfaction, and student exams for religious subjects are very good. Another result that is no less important for students is to enter academic and non-academic competitions related to religion and culture, such as quiz competitions, traditional Balinese Fashion Show, *dharmagita*, *jegeg-bagus*, and so on. The results obtained by the student show that the product resulting from the cultivation of religious teachings and character is in line with expectations.

## Conclusion

Based on the results of the research data analysis, it can be concluded that the students' believe that the Hindu religious education teachers have given quality education service. Besides, it was also confirmed by the teachers that they always tried to their best in delivering the instruction. However, since the Covid-19 pandemic caused some restrictions, the teachers felt that they faced some constraints in doing the teaching and learning process. Since this study was only limited to see the students' and teachers' responses on the quality of the Hindu religious education service during Covid-19 pandemic, a further study needs to be conducted to evaluate the effectiveness of the instruction. The results of this study need to be supported by the study that shows the effectiveness of the instruction from the students' achievements.

## Acknowledgments

The authors would like to express their deepest gratitude to 1) The Committee for Competitive Research Based on the Outputs of the Center for Research and Development of Religious and Religious Education in 2021, which has provided the opportunity for researchers by providing fund to complete the proposed proposal, 2) Prof. Dr. Farida Hanun, M.Pd. as a companion in this research who has provided a lot of input and guidance so that this research becomes perfect, 3) The Principal of SMA in Singaraja who has permitted researchers to take data to school, 4) Brothers of students who have participated as data collectors in research, and 5) Employees, the team for developing scientific papers, and all parties who take part in the research that the authors cannot mention one by one so that this paper can be completed on time and according to plan.

## References

- Abdullah, B. (2020). Religious Education and Personal Mentality; As A Practical Existence of Students. *Journal of Research and Multidisciplinary*, 3(1), 204–214.
- Anam, S., Degeng, I. N. S., Murtadho, N., & Kuswandi, D. (2019). The moral education and internalization of humanitarian values in pesantren. *Journal for the Education of Gifted Young Scientists*, 7(4), 815–834. <https://doi.org/10.17478/jegys.629726>
- Asrifan, A. (2020). *Pandemic, Humanity and Education*.



- <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.31219/osf.io/q2gpk>
- Bellés-Obrero, C., & Duchini, E. (2021). Who benefits from general knowledge? *Economics of Education Review*, 85, 102122. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.econedurev.2021.102122>
- Castelló-Climent, A., & Hidalgo-Cabrillana, A. (2012). The role of educational quality and quantity in the process of economic development. *Economics of Education Review*, 31(4), 391–409. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.econedurev.2011.11.004>
- Chalkiadaki, A. (2018). A Systematic Literature Review of 21st Century Skills and Competencies in Primary Education. *International Journal of Instruction*, 11(3), 1–16.
- Davidson, M., Khmelkov, V., Baker, K., & Lickona, T. (2011). Values education: The Power2Achieve approach for building sustainability and enduring impact. *International Journal of Educational Research*, 50(3), 190–197. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijer.2011.07.006>
- Law of the Republic of Indonesia Number 20 of 2003 concerning the National Education System, (2003).
- Dumciuviene, D. (2015). The Impact of Education Policy to Country Economic Development. *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 191, 2427–2436. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sbspro.2015.04.302>
- Gedifew, M. T. (2020). Exploring the instructional leadership development practices in Ethiopia. *Journal of Education and Learning (EduLearn)*, 14(3), 402–410. <https://doi.org/10.11591/edulearn.v14i3.15375>
- Government Regulation of the Republic of Indonesia Number 55 of 2007 concerning Religious Education and Religious Education, (2007).
- Gunawan, A., & Wahyuni, S. F. (2018). The Effect of Marketing Mix, Service Quality, Islamic Values and Institutional Image on Students's Satisfaction and Loyalty. *Expert Journal of Marketing*, 6(2), 95–105.
- Hayadin, H. O. (2018). Indeks Layanan Pendidikan Agama pada SMA dan Smk di 34 Ibu Kota Provinsi. *Edukasi*, 16(1). <https://doi.org/10.32729/edukasi.v16i1.458>
- Permendikbud No 32 of 2018 concerning Technical Standards for Minimum Education Services, (2018).
- Miles, M. B., Huberman, A. M., & Saldaña, J. (2014). *Qualitative data analysis* (3rd ed.). SAGE Publication.
- Mukhamedov, G. I., Khodjamkulov, U. N., & Shofkorov, A. M. (2000). The Effect of Diversity of the Nationality, Board of Director, Investment Decision, and Financing Decision. *Impact Factor: International Scientific Journal Theoretical & Applied Science*, May. <https://doi.org/10.15863/TAS>
- Onyema, E. M. (2020). Impact of Coronavirus Pandemic on Education. *Journal of Education and Practice*, 11(13), 108–121. <https://doi.org/10.7176/jep/11-13-12>
- Puchalski, C., Ferrell, B. R., Borneman, T., DiFrances Remein, C., Haythorn, T., & Jacobs, C. (2021). Implementing quality improvement efforts in spiritual care: outcomes from the interprofessional spiritual care education curriculum. *Journal of Health Care Chaplaincy*, 1–12. <https://doi.org/10.1080/08854726.2021.1917168>
- Rokhman, F., Hum, M., Syaifudin, A., & Yuliati. (2014). Character Education for Golden Generation 2045 (National Character Building for Indonesian Golden Years). *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 141, 1161–1165. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sbspro.2014.05.197>
- Rykkje, L., Søvik, M. B., Ross, L., McSherry, W., Cone, P., & Giske, T. (2021). Educational interventions and strategies for spiritual care in nursing and healthcare students and staff: A scoping review. *Journal of Clinical Nursing*, n/a(n/a). <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1111/jocn.16067>

- Shaturaev, J. (2021). Indonesia: Superior Policies and Management for Better Education (Community development through Education). *Архив Научных Исследований*, 20.
- Sopandi, E., & Siswanto, A. (2021). *Implementasi pendidikan agama dalam nilai karakter di lembaga pendidikan paud*. 19(3), 303–316.
- Stufflebeam, D. L. (2000). *The CIPP Model for Evaluation*. In: *Stufflebeam D.L., Madaus G.F., Kellaghan T. (eds) Evaluation Models. Evaluation in Education and Human Services*, vol 49. (pp. 279–317). Springer US. [https://doi.org/10.1007/0-306-47559-6\\_16](https://doi.org/10.1007/0-306-47559-6_16)
- Stufflebeam, D. L. (2003). The CIPP Model for Evaluation. In T. Kellaghan, D. L. Stufflebeam, & L. A. Wingate (Eds.), *International handbook of educational evaluation* (9th ed., pp. 31–62). Kluwer Academic Publishers.
- Sudarsana, I. K., Marsono, Desi Sentana, G. D. & Mastini, G. N. (2023). The Impact of Post-Online Learning Gadget Usage on Students' Hinduism Learning Behavior and Learning Outcomes. *European Chemical Bulletin*, 12(5), 5094-5109 <https://doi.org/10.31838/ecb/2023.12.5.396>
- Sunu, I. G. K. A. (2011). *Pengelolaan Pendidikan Multikultural: Studi Kasus pada SMP/MTs di Provinsi Bali*. Universitas Pendidikan Indonesia.
- Tjiptono, F. (2020). *Strategi Pemasaran, Edisi 2*. Andi Offset.
- Tjiptono, F., & Chandra, G. (2012). *Service, Quality Satisfaction*. Andi Offset.
- Zhu, X., Lee, M., Chew, E. A. L., Goh, L. J., Dong, L., & Bartlam, B. (2021). “When nothing happens, nobody is afraid!” beliefs and perceptions around self-care and health-seeking behaviours: Voices of patients living with diabetic lower extremity amputation in primary care. *International Wound Journal*, 18(6), 850–861. <https://doi.org/10.1111/iwj.13587>